

**Eastern West Virginia Community and Technical College  
COURSE ASSESSMENT REPORT**

<b>Course Title and Number:</b> <b>Business Management Capstone BUS 276</b>	<b>Academic Term and Year of Assessment Activity (Ex: Fall, 2014)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fall 2013 and 2018</li> <li>• Spring 2013, 2014 ,2016, 2017, 2018 and 2019</li> <li>• Summer 2014 and 2016</li> </ul>
<b>Report Submitted By:</b> Seyed Mirkhani	<b>Number of Students Assessed:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fall 2013 (six students) and 2018 (two)</li> <li>• Spring 2013 (seven students), 2014 (five), 2016 (three), 2017 (6), 2018 (two) and 2019 (three)</li> <li>• Summer 2014 (four students) and 2016 (one)</li> </ul>
<b>Date Report Submitted:</b> 8/06/19	<b>Number of Sections Included:</b> 10 sections
<b>Course Delivery Format (list all modalities used in sections assessed. Ex: web based, VDL, traditional section, hybrid course, etc.):</b> Traditional sections utilizing Blackboard  <p>Students discuss their capstone projects with the instructor. The meetings between the instructors and students take place in three formats: face-to-face, over the phone, or via the web. Majority of the assignments are submitted through Blackboard. Some students submit their assignments through E-mail or drop off in person.</p>	

<b>Course Role in the Curriculum</b> <b>Provide a description of the role the course serves in the curriculum (i.e. general education requirement, program technical core, restricted elective, etc.). Note all as appropriate.</b>	
<p>Business Management Capstone (BUS 276) is intended to be a culminating experience for graduating students that provides an alternative for the Business Management Internship (BUS 278). Business Management students enrolled in the Capstone are expected to complete a substantive project that demonstrates broad, comprehensive knowledge of the disciplines. Students should take the course during their last semester prior to graduation.</p>	

<b>Previous Assessment Reports and Results</b> <b>Date of Previous Assessment:</b> Spring 2010 <b>List of Outcomes Not Met:</b> See below <b>Summary of Actions Taken to Address Unmet Learning Outcomes: Append additional pages if necessary. If appending, include notation in box to “See attached”.</b>	
<p>In spring 2010 two of the outcomes related to Accounting and Management were not met. The outcomes of the course were revised in 2017.</p> <p>From assessment report of 2010: “The college received a grant to promote entrepreneurship. As a result, it purchased 40 licenses for business plan. This fall semester the capstone students are required to utilize the business plan software.”</p>	

Using the Business Plan Pro Software helped business students to write more comprehensive business plans and score higher in the management and accounting sections of their projects. However, because of the licensing restrictions, each software had to be assigned to only one student and could not be used by other students. Additionally, the software did not cover important subjects such as business law, technology and economics in significant detail.

#### Assessment Methods

**Provide a description of the assessment process used. Include description of instrument and performance standards in description. Note all methods.**

##### **Assessment Methods:**

Because of the small class size (please see the table below for enrollment figures), and because of the differing course designs and learning activities used by the course's instructors, the course has been difficult to assess. The course was last assessed in Spring 2010 so now, nine years later, an adequate number have completed the course for assessment purposes. Also, because of the variety of course designs, the primary focus of this assessment report is based on the comprehensive business plan project, which is common to all the Capstone sections taught since Spring 2010.

Formative and summative assessments are used in the course as students submit drafts of the business plan components for feedback and submit complementary assignments designed to strengthen the business plan.

The comprehensive business plan project and related assignments align with the five course outcomes for BUS 276, as indicated in the explanation below.

##### **Outcome one: Write a comprehensive business plan**

This outcome is evaluated based on the successful creation of a viable business plan during the course. A comprehensive business plan includes several sections, including:

- Executive Summary
- Company description
- Market analysis.
- Organizational management
- Sales strategies
- Funding requirements
- Financial projections
- PowerPoint presentation

##### **Outcome two: Apply accounting, technology, marketing, and management concepts**

This outcome is evaluated based on the performance of the students in completing the market analysis, organizational management, sales strategies, funding requirements, financial projections, and PowerPoint presentation sections of the business plan.

##### **Outcome 3: Identify threats, opportunities, weaknesses and strengths of the proposed business plan**

This outcome is evaluated via a student-conducted SWOT analysis (Strengths, Weaknesses Opportunities, Threats) of the proposed business plan.

##### **Outcome 4: Discuss challenges facing the business**

This outcome is evaluated through an essay assignment that examines management and ethical challenges that could affect the proposed businesses. The essay must also present and defend potential solutions to those challenges.

##### **Outcome 5: Identify sources available for financing a business**

This outcome is evaluated by evaluating the funding requirement and financial projection sections of a business plan as well as writing formal cover letters to raise funds for proposed business.

<b>Course Level Assessment Summary of Outcomes, Indicators and Results</b>			
<b>Add additional rows to table if necessary</b>			
<b>Learning Outcomes (Insert learning outcomes assessed during this cycle)</b>	<b>Indicator (Insert indicators used for each outcome: exam question, scoring rubric, etc. Be specific)</b>	<b>Percent of Correct Responses</b>	<b>Performance Standard Met (75%)* (yes or no)</b>
Outcome 1: Write a comprehensive Business Plan	See table above	91%	Yes
<b>Outcome 2:</b> Apply accounting, technology, marketing, and management concepts		93%	Yes
<b>Outcome 3:</b> Identify threats, opportunities, weaknesses and strengths of the proposed business plan		91%	Yes
Outcome 4: Discuss challenges facing the business		95%	Yes
Outcome 5: Identify sources available for financing a business		95%	Yes

\* Please note if using a different minimum performance standard.

<b>Assessment Results</b>		
<b>Provide a summary of results including tables/charts. Incorporate information from previous assessments as appropriate. Append additional pages if necessary. If appending, include notation in box to "See attached".</b>		
<b>Assignments:</b>	<b>Grades</b>	<b>Outcome Met</b>
All written assignments except the PowerPoint presentation		
Writing a Business Plan	84%	
Business Idea	93%	
Executive Summary	95%	
PowerPoint	90%	

Approved Assessment Committee:  
Approved LOT:

Average of Outcome One	91%	Yes
Outcome 2		
Accounting and Finance	96%	
Management	97%	
Marketing	86%	
Average of Outcome two	93%	Yes
Outcome 3		
SWOT Analysis		
Average of Outcome 3	91%	Yes
Outcome 4		
Quality of Entrepreneurship	97%	
Essay on Ethical issues	92%	
Average of Outcome 4	95%	Yes
Outcome 5		
Financial analysis	96%	
Letter to creditor	94%	
Average of Outcome 5	95%	Yes

All course outcomes were met. In spring of 2010 two outcomes related to accounting and management were not met. During this assessment period, students received average score of 96% in Accounting/Finance and 97% in Management sections of business plan.

<b>Conclusion</b>
<p><b>Provide a brief summary of conclusions derived based on analysis of data. Append additional pages if necessary. If appending, include notation in box to “See attached”.</b></p> <p>All five outcomes of the course were met. While writing a business plan shows the competency of students in starting a business, it doesn’t necessarily show an in-depth knowledge of students regarding subjects such as management, marketing, economics, and accounting. To assess the competency of students in business subjects, the performance of the students in the NOCTI test has been assessed as another way of evaluating comprehensive knowledge of the discipline as the course description requires.</p> <p>Since fall of 2016 (last program review), nine students took the NOCTI test. The following table shows the performance of the students:</p>

	Student 1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	Natinal AVG	Eastern AVG	Performance	Percentage
<b>NOCTI Results 9 Capstone Students</b>													
Bus Mgt Technical Skills	62.5	68.8	90.9	81.3	68.8	62.5	75	81.3	68.8	66.7	73.32	6.62	10%
Business Mgt Subscore	77.3	95.5	62.5	81.8	95.5	86.4	81.8	63.6	68.2	81	79.18	-1.82	-2%
Bus Mgt Academic Foundations	92.3	76.9	69.2	92.3	84.6	38.5	61.5	69.2	92.3	75.3	75.20	-0.10	0%
Bus Mgt Systems Subscore	50	100	66.7	83.3	100	83.3	50	66.7	66.7	84.6	74.08	-10.52	-12%
Ethical and Legal Responsibil	100	100	100	66.7	100	66.7	83.3	83.3	100	86.2	88.89	2.69	3%
Communications	71.4	85.7	85.7	85.7	85.7	85.7	57.1	57.1	85.7	73.6	77.76	4.16	6%
Info Tech Applications	86.7	86.7	80	80	93.3	66.7	80	60	86.7	77.6	80.01	2.41	3%
Prob Solv Critical Thinking	71.4	71.4	57.1	57.1	57.1	42.9	71.4	42.9	42.9	67.5	57.13	-10.37	-15%
Leadership/Teamwork	100	100	71.4	71.4	100	71.4	71.4	85.7	85.7	80.9	84.11	3.21	4%
Safety/Hlth/Environment	83.3	100	100	83.3	83.3	83.3	100	66.7	66.7	83.5	85.18	1.68	2%
Employability/Career Dev	80	100	60	100	60	100	80	60	60	81.7	77.78	-3.92	-5%
Eastern Student NOCTI - Raw	79.1	87.3	77.3	80.9	85.5	70	74.5	67.3	75.5	78	77.49	-0.57	-1%
Eastern Student NOCTI - Composite	79.5	89.5	76.7	80.3	84.4	71.6	73.8	67.0	74.9				

The matrix below maps the course outcomes (columns) and NOCTI outcomes (rows), and also shows what courses cover subjects that are common in both NOCTI outcomes and course outcomes. Based on the NOCTI's results, students underperformed in the areas of System (Role of Government and Companies Hierarchy) and problem solving and critical thinking by scoring 12.43 percent and 15.38 percent respectively. They also underperformed employability and career development by 4.8% (see the table below). While the NOCTI outcomes are not the same as the course outcomes, they align well with the course description that requires comprehensive knowledge of the discipline. Considering that the NOCTI outcomes are better representation of the discipline, it is reasonable to revise the course outcomes to align the course description with the course outcomes

						Eastern Courses Covering NOCTI's Outcomes	Capstone Outcomes				
Revised	1-11-19	NOCTI National	Eastern Average	Outperf. ?	NOCTI Outcome Met		Outcome 1: Business Plan	Outcome 2: Apply ACC. Tech. MKT. MGT.	Outcome 3: SWOT Analysis	Outcome 4: Discuss Challenges	Outcome 5: Sources of Financing
	<b>NOCTI Ourcomes</b>										
	<b>Bus Mgt Technical Skills</b>	66.7	73.32	9.93%	Yes						
	Define and differentiate among various types of businesses (e.g., corporation, limited liability, partnership) Accounting					ACC 121 BUS 101 ACC 120	ACC 120 BUS 101	ACC 120 ACC 121			
	• Use planning tools to guide and manage an organization's business activities					ACC 120 ACC 121 BUS 101 MGT 250 CIS 119 MKT 260	MGT 250, CIS 119	MGT 250 MKT 260 ACC 120 ACC 121			
	• Apply marketing techniques to foster business growth					MKT 260 BUS 101 MGT 250	MGT 250 BUS 101	MTK 260	MKT 260	MKT 260 MGT 250	
	• Plan and evaluate the use of financial resources to effectively manage a business					ACC 120 ACC 121		ACC 120 ACC 121			ACC 120 ACC 121
	• Demonstrate understanding of doing business in a global environment					ECN 201 BUS 101 MKT 260					
	<b>Business Mgt Subscore</b>	81	79.18	-2.25%	No						
	• Supervise, direct, motivate, and evaluate employees					BUS 101 MGT 250 MGT 251		MGT 250			
	• Develop, implement, and monitor tactical/strategic plans to manage growth, meet goals, and organizational needs					MGT 250 CIS 119 BUS 101 MKT 260	BUS 101	MGT 250 CIS 119			
	• Facilitate change and implement improvement processes to optimize organizational effectiveness					MGT 250 BUS 101		MGT 250 BUS 101			
	• Manage projects, staff schedules, and departmental budgets					MGT 250 ACC 120 ACC 121		MGT 250 ACC 120			
	<b>Bus Mgt Academic Foundation</b>	75.3	75.2	-0.13%	No						
	• Apply reading skills in a business environment					BUS 101 BUS 206		BUS 101			
	• Apply writing skills in a business environment					BUS 278 BUS 276					
	• Apply mathematical skills in a business environment					MTH 115		ACC			
	• Apply economic skills in a business environment					ECN 201 ECN 202					
	<b>Systems</b>	84.6	74.08	-12.43%	No						
	• Demonstrate understanding of the role of government and other regulatory bodies in business					BUS 206 MKT 260 ACC 120 ACC 121 BUS 101		MKT 260 BUS 101			
	• Demonstrate understanding of company hierarchies and roles within company structures					MGT 250 BUS 101		MGT 250 BUS 101			
	<b>Ethical and Legal Responsi.</b>	86.2	88.89	3.12%	Yes						
	• Exhibit leadership practices to improve productivity and quality of the working environment					MGT 250 BUS 101		MGT 250			
	• Work effectively in a team environment to accomplish company goals and improve quality of the working environment					MGT 250 BUS 101		MGT 250			
	<b>Communications</b>	73.6	77.76	5.65%	Yes						
	• Locate, organize, and reference written information from reliable sources to communicate with coworkers and clients					BUS 276 BUS 278	BUS 276	MGT 250 ACC 250 MKT 250			
	• Develop and deliver formal and informal presentations using appropriate media to engage and inform audiences					CIS 119 CIS 114					
	• Apply listening skills and interpret verbal and nonverbal behaviors to enhance communication with coworkers and clients					MGT 250 BUS 101		MGT 250			
	<b>Info Tech Applications</b>	77.6	80.01	3.11%	Yes						
	• Use software such as word processors and spreadsheets to perform common business applications					CIS 119 CIS 121 CIS 117 CIS 114	CIS 114	CIS 119			
	• Use software such as databases to track and maintain business information					CIS 121 CIS 114 CIS 119					
	• Use social media and mobile technology appropriately					CIS 114					
						CIS 119 CIS 114					
Approved Assessment Committee:											
Approved LOT:											
	<b>Prob Solv Critical Thinking</b>	67.5	57.13	-15.36%	No						
	• Use problem solving and critical thinking skills to locate good sources of information about problems and					ACC 120 ACC 121			MKT 260		



	Capstone	Internship	Difference	%
Bus Mgt Technical Skills	73.32	80.65	7.33	10%
Business Mgt Subscore	79.18	89.57	10.39	13%
Bus Mgt Academic Foundations	75.20	79.99	4.79	6%
Bus Mgt Systems Subscore	74.08	91.67	17.59	24%
Ethical and Legal Responsibil	88.89	91.66	2.77	3%
Communications	77.76	77.12	-0.64	-1%
Info Tech Applications	80.01	89.33	9.32	12%
Prob Solv Critical Thinking	57.13	69.98	12.85	22%
Leadership/Teamwork	84.11	87.13	3.02	4%
Safety/Hlth/Environment	85.18	91.65	6.47	8%
Employability/Career Dev	77.78	82	4.22	5%
<b>Eastern Student NOCTI - Raw</b>	77.49	84.92	7.43	10%

Combined performance of the capstone students and internship students in the NOCTI exam:

The above table shows that the business management students can benefit from improving their critical thinking. Business courses and general education courses have be reviewed to see how critical thinking of the students can be improved. More emphasis will be placed on courses related to Employability and Business Management Systems. The above table also shows that the business students have outperformed the NOCTI's national average by 4.1%.

	National AVG	Eastern AVG	Outper - Underp	Percentage		
<b>Combined Results 19 Students</b>						
Bus Mgt Technical Skills	66.7	76.99	10.29	15.42%		
Business Mgt Subscore	81	84.37	3.37	4.17%	NOCTI Raw	78
Bus Mgt Academic Foundations	75.3	77.60	2.29	3.05%	NOCTI AVG	77.1
Bus Mgt Systems Subscore	84.6	82.87	-1.73	-2.04%	Eastern AVG	81.2
Ethical and Legal Responsibil	86.2	90.27	4.07	4.73%		
Communications	73.6	77.44	3.84	5.21%		
Info Tech Applications	77.6	84.67	7.07	9.11%		
Prob Solv Critical Thinking	67.5	63.56	-3.94	-5.84%		
Leadership/Teamwork	80.9	85.62	4.72	5.84%		
Safety/Hlth/Environment	83.5	88.41	4.91	5.88%		
Employability/Career Dev	81.7	79.89	-1.81	-2.22%		
<b>Eastern Student NOCTI -</b>	78	81.20	3.15	4.04%		

**Action Plan and Date for Reassessment**  
**Identify action plan for improvement or maintaining current performance levels including**

Approved Assessment Committee:  
 Approved LOT:

**outcomes identified for re-assessment, curriculum revision, LOT proposal, new or revised course activities to reinforce learning outcomes, etc. Append additional pages if necessary. If appending, include notation in box to “See attached”.**

Based on the review of the students’ performance in the capstone courses, NOCTI tests and outcome alignments it is recommended that the outcomes of the course be revised to:

1. Demonstrate a basic knowledge of Accounting
2. Demonstrate an understanding of Marketing
3. Utilize computers and their applications as they relate to business functions
4. Demonstrate proficiency in Business Management
5. Demonstrate understating of ethical and legal responsibilities
6. Demonstrate a basic understanding of economics

The above outcomes also are better aligned with the program outcomes. Thus, making the course as one of the assessment methods to assess the business program. The above recommendation will be discussed with the business faculty and more emphasis will be placed on the NOCTI outcomes that were not met.

A major project such as analyzing a public company can be a valuable assessment tool for the new outcomes. Major companies have significant background in Accounting, Marketing, Management and other areas of Business Management. Information regarding these companies is publicly available. Many business schools use this project in their capstone courses.

**Date for reassessment:** BUS 276 is a low enrollment course. Once sufficient number of students (12 students) take the course, it will be reassessed.

**Assessment Committee Recommendation/Approval  
(To be posted by Assessment Committee Chair)**

- Approved as presented
- Approved with recommendations for future reports (Explanation Required)
- Resubmission Required. Reason for Resubmission:

**Date: 9/13/19**

Revised 1-11-19

Approved Assessment Committee:  
Approved LOT: